



**INSIGHT**  
Building Capacity to Deal with Human Trafficking and Transit Routes in Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

# MINUTES

## ANTI-TRAFFICKING WEEK SEMINAR

**“Vulnerability and resilience of women trapped in circuits of human trafficking: between demands for security and the fight against criminality”**

21<sup>st</sup> October 2019, Padua (Italy)

### Seminario

**Vulnerabilità e resilienza delle donne nigeriane intrappolate nei circuiti di tratta: tra domande di sicurezza e lotta alla criminalità.**

Evento incluso nell'ambito del programma della settimana europea anti-tratta 2019, in collaborazione con il progetto N.A.Ve



21 ottobre



ore: 9.00-18.00

Sala L. Paladin, Palazzo Moroni, Padova



United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization



UNESCO Chair on Social and Spatial Inclusion of International Migrants, Urban Policies and Practice University Iuav of Venice





**INSigHT**  
Building Capacity to Deal with Human Trafficking and Transit Routes in Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

## Agenda

1. Welcome, Introduction and presentation of the INSigHT Action
2. Panel 1: Research perspectives
3. Panel 2: Demands for security and the fight against criminality
4. Discussion
- 5: Lunch break
6. Panel 3: The perspective of social operators' perspective and the collective imaginary on human trafficking
7. Video extracts on human trafficking and migration from Nigeria to Italy

\*\*\*

## Executive Summary

### 1. Welcome, Introduction and presentation of the INSigHT Action

*Giovanna Marconi*, SSIIM UNESCO Chair of the University IUAV of Venice, INSigHT Project Manager

*Barbara Maculan*, President of Equality ATI, Partner of INSigHT Action

### 2. Short presentation of the seminar

*Michela Semprebon* (SSIIM Unesco Chair of the University IUAV University of Venice, INSigHT Research Coordinator)

### 3. Panel 1: Research perspectives

“Security policies: which approach?” (*Valeria Verdolini, Researcher, Bicocca University, Milan*)

“Human trafficking: gender and intersectionality” (*Giulia Garofalo Geymonat, Researcher, Cà Foscari University*)

“Beggars, window cleaners, homeless people and street vendors in Messina: between urban populism, space removal and resistances” (*Pietro Saitta, Researcher, Messina University*)

Moderator: *Michela Semprebon*

### Valeria Verdolini

Valeria Verdolini proposed a theoretical interpretation of local security policies and the so-called “urban populism”, focusing on the entanglement of economic inequalities, security claims and migratory flows in the urban context. Following the economic crisis, the perception of insecurity on the side of urban populations increased, as well as the competition for the access to welfare resources. Since 2008, Italian majors have been allowed to promote new local ordinances to deal with “urgent” security issues. These policy initiatives have been rarely accompanied by complementary long-term social interventions to reduce economic inequalities. At the same time,





INSigHT  
Building Capacity to Deal with  
Human Trafficking and  
Transit Routes in  
Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

at the national level, recent policy initiatives have often adopted a repressive approach, addressing citizens' fears of and intolerance towards immigrants. In this wider context, anti-trafficking policies, and connected policies addressing prostitution should aim at eradicating criminal activities but also at promoting initiatives to reduce economic inequalities and related social exclusion processes rather than focusing on citizens' call for urban order thus intervening with the removal of "poverty" from the street and anyone associate with it.

### Giulia Garofalo Geymonat

Giulia Garofalo Geymonat observed that the policy-oriented research conducted in the framework of the INSigHT Action contributes to filling an existing gap in the research field on sexual exploitation and sex work, that is to say research fields that mostly adopt a theoretical approach excluding the views of social workers and policy-makers. The INSigHT research project will be also useful to provide insight on the anti-trafficking policies adopted in Italy (i.e. art.18/2000) that can be considered an example of excellent practice at European level. From the legal perspective, it is a model that drew from the anti-mafia policies: in order to fight criminal organizations, people must be encouraged to leave the respective organization and this is possible whereby they are offered protection, besides socio-economic alternatives. From the social perspective, the Italian model is represented by the convergence of different feminist approaches, which share the common objective of fighting against sexual exploitation and women emancipation. Giulia stressed also that in order to understand the recent evolution of anti-trafficking policies, in Italy but also in the wider European context, the current challenges as well as the social impact of the policies themselves, an intersectional approach must be adopted, considering the intersection of factors related to gender, migration and class.

### *Short English bibliography*

- Crowhurst, I. (2012) *Approaches to the regulation and governance of prostitution in contemporary Italy*, in "Sexuality research and social policy", 9, 3, pp. 223-232
- Östergren, P. (2017) *From zero-tolerance to full integration: Rethinking prostitution policies*, Demand AT Working Paper, retrieved on line at <http://demandat.eu>
- Jahnsen, S., Wagenaar, H. (2017) *Assessing prostitution policies in Europe*, London, Routledge.
- Ward, E., & Wylie, G. Eds. (2017) *Feminism, prostitution and the state: The politics of neo-abolitionism*, London, Taylor & Francis

### Pietro Saitta

This contribution focused on the "security ordinances" that have been recently promoted by the major of a Southern Italian municipality, Messina. This ordinance— similarly to others promoted in Northern Italian cities- aims at preserving urban security and urban decorum through the control and repression of social phenomena such as begging and homelessness. This ordinance represents a form of "criminalization of poverty" as well as a kind of "urban populism", as made evident by the considerable media exposure of repressive interventions. According to Pietro Saitta, the actual effects of the ordinance must be analyzed in light of the specificity of the Southern Italian socio-economic context. Differently from Northern cities, in cities such as Messina, poverty is an inter-ethnic phenomenon and both Italian and foreign-born residents are active in the informal economy sector of street- vending.





INSIGHT  
Building Capacity to  
Deal with  
Human Trafficking and  
Transit Routes in  
Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

#### 4. Panel 2: Security claims and fight against criminal activities

“Human trafficking and anti-prostitution urban ordinances” (*Marco Ferrero, Lawyer, ASGI*)

“The role of the National Police in the fight against human trafficking and criminal organizations” (*Davide Boaretto, Ispettore Superiore, Questura di Padova, Squadra Mobile, Sezione Criminalità straniera e prostituzione*)

“The role of Local Police in the fight against human trafficking and criminal organizations” (*Massimo Pennella, Official of the Area Controllo del territorio e grandi eventi, Local Police of Verona*)

“New exploitation strategies within foreigner criminal organizations: the relevance of a multi-agency approach” (*David Mancini, Magistrate, Procura della Repubblica de l’Aquila*)

Moderator: *Serena Scarabello* (SSIIM Unesco Chair of the University IUAV of Venice, INSIGHT Researcher)

##### Marco Ferrero

Urban security ordinances became a widespread trend in 2008. Similar ordinances aim at solving and repressing various social phenomena, such as prostitution, begging, vandalism etc. From the juridical perspective, the legitimacy of these norms has been widely discussed. Several of them were declared unconstitutional and discriminatory. In the field of sex work, these repressive policies contrast with the person-centered logic of the national anti-trafficking policy that focuses on contrasting exploitation, but also on the empowerment of victims of human trafficking, their protection and socio-economic inclusion.

##### Davide Boaretto

Davide Boaretto has matured long-term experience in the field of anti-trafficking. As he stressed, any fight against trafficking must ensure that victims are supported if they decide to report criminal organizations that are exploiting them. He also underlined the necessity to sustain a strong protection program capable of protecting victims after they report to the police. With reference to the subsequent investigation process, he noted the crucial role of interpreters, whose collaboration is however not always fruitful since few expert interpreters are available in this specific field. He further added that a strong collaboration must be building with street unit and third sector organisations, since they can be best effective in explaining victims they should not fear the police. Yet, on-going collaboration between the third sector and the police need improving.

##### Massimo Pennella

Massimo Pennella described the role of Local Police (in Verona) as strategic in fighting criminal organizations and in protecting victims. As explained, the Local Police acts at a “second level”, connecting the National Police, the third sector and the local population. Residents often contact the Local Police to complain about the presence of street workers, beggars or drug dealers. On its side, the Local Police does not directly take contacts with people in the street, but signals any relevant case both to the National Police and local social operators, in order to promote integrated forms of intervention.

##### David Mancini

Transnational criminal organizations involved in human trafficking became, in the last year, stronger and diversified in term of exploitation activities (sexual and labor exploitation, begging, drug dealing). According to Mancini, we should continue studying their modus operandi, that is continuously changing to adapt to different socio-historical contexts. Social and juridical operators should strengthen their collaboration in order to ameliorate the identification process of victims of trafficking and strengthen the systems of protection and social inclusion.





INSigHT  
Building Capacity to  
Deal with  
Human Trafficking and  
Transit Routes in  
Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

## 5. Panel 3: The social operators' perspective and the collective imaginary on human trafficking

"Outdoor sex work in Italy and the role of the "street units" (*Gianfranco Della Valle, Numero Verde Nazionale Anti-tratta, Venice Municipality*)

"Human trafficking from Nigeria and stereotypes in the media" (*Anna Pozzi, journalist, "Carta di Roma" association*)

"Human trafficking in the Nigerian movies on migration issues" (*Alessandro Jedlowski, Chaire Diasporas Africaines, Science Po Bordeaux / Université Bordeaux-Montaigne*)

Moderator: *Gaia Borgato* (Coordinator Equality ATI, Partner of INSigHT Action)

### Gianfranco Della Valle

The Italian anti-trafficking system has been created and implemented, since the very beginning, with the fundamental collaboration of organizations involved in harm reduction actions. First and foremost, Street Units can indeed create meaningful relationships with sex workers in the street, thus helping institutions to identify victims of trafficking. Critical in the construction of these relationships is the representations that most of the people have of the police and the initial difficulty in differentiating the role of Street Units. Moving onto trends, Gianfranco Della Valle explained that the number of sex workers working in the streets in Italy is decreasing, while indoor prostitution is increasing, thus posing severe challenges to the protection system. With reference to trends, he finally reported that the number of Nigerian women prostituting in the streets has been diminishing.

### Anna Pozzi

Media attention to migration processes and, in particular, migration from Nigeria to Italy has been increasing in the last five years, following the increased number of arrivals by sea. Mass media representations of this phenomenon must be analyzed critically. Compared to other European nations, Italy presents the highest gap between perception and real presence of migrants. Political discourses and media narration have had the main responsibility in this sense. The narration on Nigerian migrants, in particular women, often fall in three stigmatized categories: "criminal", "prostitutes" and "victims". These stereotypes influence the collective imaginary of the population and social workers, thus overshadowing subjectivities and individual agency.

### Alessandro Jedlowski

Nollywood is one of the greatest film industries in the world. It has paid increasing attention to diaspora issues and experiences. The cultural consumption of Nollywood films is high in the global Nigerian diaspora and many film production companies were created in several diasporic countries, including Italy. The Nollywood movies produced in Italy represent the life of Nigerian citizens in Italy and give the possibility to analyze the representation of the Italian context while circulating them within Nigerian communities. What is interesting is that the issues of prostitution, drug dealing and criminal activities are often present in the representation of Italy and consolidate the idea of Italy as a "secondary" destination country.

### Short English bibliography

- Krings, M., Okome, O. (eds.) (2013) *Global Nollywood: The Transnational Dimensions of an African Video Film Industry*, Indiana University Press, Bloomington
- Haynes, J. (2016) *Nollywood: the creation of Nigerian film genres*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago
- Miller, J. (2016) *Nollywood Central: The Nigerian Videofilm Industry*. BFI/Palgrave, Londra





**INSIGHT**  
Building Capacity to Deal with Human Trafficking and Transit Routes in Nigeria, Italy, Sweden

## 6. Movie extracts on human trafficking and migration in Italy

### Bola's dirge

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WIT6vxAkes>

Bola's Dirge is an avant-garde short film about the struggle of a young woman through poverty and the circumstances that lead her to a life of prostitution; and her quest for redemption when she chooses to keep a pregnancy.

### Lodgers

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=euWmEUFCHq8>

LODGERS is an award-winning comedy by Keni Ogunlola starring African comedy king AY Makun.

